

Ethics as a Tool for Deliberation and for the Development of Healthy Public Policies: The Case of Unsanitary Housing in Montreal

JASP 2010, Quebec City

November 24, 2010

Stéphane Perron, MD, M.Sc., FRCPC

Agenda

- Guidelines for reporting and intervening
- Background
- Reporting
- Initial management
- Medical/environmental survey
- Survey results and recommendations
- Follow-up

Intervention guidelines

- Primacy of health protection
- Scientific rigour
- Equity
- Proportionality
- Precaution
- Empowerment
- Transparency
- Openness

From Drapeau S., **Cadre de référence en gestion des risques pour la santé dans le réseau québécois de la santé publique.** Institut national de santé publique du Québec, 2003, 85 pages.

Agence de la santé
et des services sociaux
de Montréal

Québec 

Background

- **Sanitary problems in Montreal housing**
 - Mould
 - Mites
 - Cockroaches
 - Mice (sometimes rats)
 - Growing problem of bedbugs in Montreal
 - Etc.
- **Health effects**
 - Respiratory health problems (allergies, irritants and infectious agents)
 - Dermatological problems
 - Mental health? (e.g. symptoms of anxiety and depression)
 - Sleep quality?
 - Social isolation?
 - Harmful, toxic products used by exterminators?
 - Impact on general health
 - Etc.
- **Ethical principle:** Primacy of health protection, scientific rigour, precaution

Reporting

- Call received from a school
- Bedbugs found on a student
 - School's administrators notify the father, who denies that there is a problem
 - Call made to the father
 - Says that there is indeed a problem, but is too afraid of the repercussions if he lodges a complaint with the city
- Ethical principle: Empowerment

Initial management

- By-law concerning the sanitation and the maintenance of housing units
 - Standards in effect
 - Tenant must send a registered letter to the owner explaining the problem and demanding that action be taken within 10 days.
 - If nothing is done, the tenant can call the city inspector.
 - Notice of an infraction
 - Report of an infraction

Initial management

- Father's fear of the owner
- According to the father, the problem is widespread.
- Fear of school authorities with respect to the infestation
- Joint decision made by the CSSS and the DSP to lodge a complaint about the building with the borough in the name of the tenant
- **Guiding ethical principles:** primacy of health protection, empowerment, confidentiality

Initial management

- The municipal inspector issues a notice of infraction concerning the owner's building.
- Precautionary measures taken by the school to avoid dispersal of bedbugs.
- Dwelling is treated, the father reports that the problem has been solved.
- **Ethical principle:** openness

Initial management

- Several weeks later a call is received from the school.
 - The student has again brought bedbugs into the school.
 - To protect its employees, the school decides to expel the child.
- **Ethical principle:** proportionality

Initial management

- In early April, Dr. Perron visited the home of the expelled child
- Dr. Perron's observations:
 - The exterminator sold insecticides for the tenant to apply himself.
 - The dwelling is in a run-down state due to poor maintenance by the owner (mould in several areas, mouldy debris on the floor).
 - A fragment of paint was seen on the floor.
 - Several members of the family repeatedly showed symptoms of upper respiratory tract infections.
 - The children presented with pica.
 - No bedbugs were visible, ruling out a severe infestation but not excluding their presence.
- Recommendation made that the school take the student back.
- **Ethical principles:** Primacy of health protection, precaution

Medical/environmental survey

- Following the finding on the run-down state of the building and after consulting with the CSSS and the *Environnement urbain et santé* (EUS) team at the DSP, a decision is made to conduct a medical/environmental survey
- Meeting organized with the CSSS, the DSP, community care givers and the borough to develop an action strategy (mid-April)
- Two key components: sanitation issues and medical questionnaire
- **Ethical principles:** primacy of health protection, openness, precaution

Medical/environmental survey DSP-CSSS

- Survey objectives
 - To detect health problems caused by housing conditions
 - To ensure appropriate management by providing the required service corridors
 - Psychosocial – CSSS
 - Medical – DSP
 - To make recommendations to the City based on our findings
 - Taking over building management
 - Eradication of vermin
 - Relocation notice for the family in poor health or with rapidly deteriorating health due to the dwelling
 - Sealed for excessive contamination following the relocation
 - To collaborate with the tenant rights organization for legal assistance
 - To ensure that management of the building will be taken over so that the unsafe conditions are brought to an end
 - **Ethical principles:** primacy of health protection, empowerment, precaution, equity, proportionality

Medical/environmental survey

- Medical/environmental survey (end of May, beginning of June)
 - CSSS – DSP
 - Hygienist - DSP
 - CSSS nurses, DSP physician
 - Social care givers from the CSSS
 - Community groups with mandates from the CSSS to organize meetings with tenants and for translation services

Medical/environmental survey

- Use of a partly validated questionnaire on:
 - General health
 - Antecedents
 - Respiratory, dermatological and mental health
 - The environment and quality of life
 - Presence of mould and vermin
- **Ethical principle:** scientific rigour

Survey results and recommendations

- Environmental health
 - The buildings and a sufficient number of dwellings were visited to establish a profile
 - Significant building envelope problems were found, with water infiltration in many places
 - Significant, active water damage in many dwellings
 - Widespread presence of mould
- Recommendations made to the City's inspection department to follow up with the owner and ensure that sanitary living conditions are provided in the buildings
- **Ethical principles:** health protection, transparency and precaution

Survey results and recommendations

- Health
 - Observations
 - Approximately 50% of tenants were reached
 - Dwelling-related health problems in over half of the units
 - Particularly related to respiratory, dermatological and mental health
 - Potentially dangerous and ineffective management of the bedbug problem (the extermination company sold extermination products to the tenant)
 - Notable presence of mice and cockroaches in the building
 - Paint chips falling off walls in the dwelling and presence of mouldy debris.

Survey results and recommendations

- Many dwellings with related health problems or threats that are serious enough to recommend relocation.
- Some tenants accepted immediately; others accepted in the weeks that followed.
- Recommendations made to the inspection service to relocate tenants, coordinating with the CSSS and City's housing agency.
- Corridors of service established for some patients.
- Recommendations made to the City on how to deal with the cockroach, bedbug and mice infestations.
- **Ethical principles:** empowerment balanced with health protection and precaution, among other principles

Follow-up

- Follow-up strategy currently being developed with the CSSS.
- **Ethical principle:** primacy of health protection

Thoughts on public policies and housing

- Macro strategies
- Meso strategies
- Micro strategies

Questions?